

EARTHWORKS * SIERRA CLUB * IDAHO CONSERVATION LEAGUE *
MONTANA ENVIRONMENTAL INFORMATION CENTER * CENTER FOR
BIOLOGICAL DIVERSITY * THE LANDS COUNCIL * FRIENDS OF THE
BOUNDARY WATERS * ROCK CREEK ALLIANCE * CLEAN WATER ALLIANCE
* OKANGAN HIGHLANDS ALLIANCE * FRIENDS OF THE KALMIOPSIS *
PATAGONIA AREA RESOURCES ALLIANCE * FRIENDS OF THE CLOQUET
VALLEY STATE FOREST * RIVERS WITHOUT BORDERS * WISCONSIN
RESOURCES PROTECTION COUNCIL * ETHICAL METALSMITHS *
NORTHERN ALASKA ENVIRONMENTAL CENTER * INFORMATION
NETWORK FOR RESPONSIBLE MINING * ADVOCACY COALITION OF
TELLURIDE * GRAND RIVERKEEPER LABRADOR * MINING WATCH
CANADA * BIG VILLAGE NETWORK * PRAIRIE HILLS AUDUBON SOCIETY *
SAVE OUR SKY BLUE WATERS * SAVE LAKE SUPERIOR ASSOCIATION *
PROGRESSIVE LEADERSHIP ALLIANCE NETWORK * GREAT BASIN
RESOURCE WATCH * KLAMATH FOREST ALLIANCE * ENVIRONMENTAL
PROTECTION INFORMATION CENTER * SPOKANE RIVERKEEPER

March 16, 2015

Thomas Tidwell, Chief
USDA Forest Service
1400 Independence Ave., SW
Washington D.C.
20250-1111

Neil Kornze, Director
U.S. Bureau of Land Management
1849 C St. NW, Rm. 5665
Washington DC
20240

Dear Forest Service Chief Tidwell and BLM Director Kornze,

We are writing on behalf of dozens of organizations, representing hundreds of thousands of people, regarding the catastrophic failure of the tailings dam at the Mount Polley mine in British Columbia, and the implications for tailings dam design and operational safety at hardrock mines on public lands throughout the United States.

Based on the findings and recommendations of the technical review panel of the Mount Polley tailings dam failure, we urge the Forest Service and BLM to take immediate measures to assess the threat posed by similar tailings dams at existing and proposed mines on public lands in the U.S.

In January, a panel of independent experts released its findings from its investigation of the Mount Polley tailings dam, a modern impoundment that breached on August 2014 and released 25 million cubic meters of tailings into the Fraser River watershed in British Columbia.¹ The panel concluded that the dam failed because of a faulty design that didn't account for the instability of the glacial till on which it was constructed. The failure was complicated by operational practices including storage of excess water in the facility and over-steepening of dam slopes.

The British Columbia Minister of Mines has called for an immediate investigation of all 123 tailings dams within the province and it executed a search warrant at the corporate and mine offices as well as the engineering firms involved in the tailings dam design and management, including AMEC and Knight Piesold.

The results of the Mount Polley investigation are of significant importance to mine management in the U.S. for a number of reasons:

- 1) Like the Mount Polley tailings dam, there are proposed and existing mines in the U.S. that are similarly located on potentially unstable glacial foundation materials, including: the existing Stillwater, East Boulder, Golden Sunlight and proposed Montanore Mine in Montana, and the existing Milepost 7 tailings dam and proposed Polymet tailings dam in Minnesota.
- 2) Knight Piesold and AMEC, two of the engineering firms involved with the construction and management of the Mount Polley tailings dam,² have also been involved with designs at tailings dams within the U.S., including controversial projects such as the proposed Pebble, Rosemont, Northmet (Polymet) and Twin Metals mines.³
- 3) Long term safety and stability of tailings dams is a crucial public safety issue, yet there's no federal agency responsible for oversight of tailings dam safety and many states impose few if any requirements. The mine tailings dam safety and construction as well as operational guidelines that exist were developed by Canadian industry and are neither specific to nor adequate from a regulatory viewpoint.
- 4) The panel of experts that reviewed the Mount Polley tailings dam failure identified critical risk factors, and made a number of key recommendations. These include:
 - ❖ Creating an independent tailings review board (ITRB) to evaluate tailings dam designs.

¹ Independent Expert Engineering and Review Panel, Report on Mount Polley Tailings Storage Facility Breach, January 30, 2015. Available at: <https://www.mountpolleyreviewpanel.ca/sites/default/files/report/ReportonMountPolleyTailingsStorageFacilityBreach.pdf>

²<http://www.vancouversun.com/news/More+search+warrants+executed+Mount+Polley+mine+failure/10791264/story.html>

³Technical Memorandum, AMEC Geomatrix to Klepfer Mining Services, Poorman Tailings Impoundment Capture Analysis, Montanore Project, November 2010.

- ❖ Using Best Available Technology (BAT) that fundamentally shifts tailings storage away from tailings ponds that store water to dry tailings, including recommendations to:
 - Eliminate surface water from the impoundment,
 - Promote unsaturated conditions in the tailings with drainage provisions, and
 - Achieve dilatant conditions throughout the tailings deposit by compaction.
- ❖ Evaluating tailings dam designs for these potential failure modes:
 - Undrained shear failure for dams with silt and clay foundation soils.
 - Water balance adequacy, including provisions and contingencies for wet years.
 - Filter adequacy, especially for dams containing broadly graded soils or mine waste.
- ❖ Applying design, construction and safety standards developed specifically for tailings dams, rather than adapting those used for water retention dams.

5. There are a significant number of large-scale mines proposed in sensitive transboundary regions between Canada and Alaska that could degrade U.S. waters and imperil important fisheries, particularly in the region between British Columbia and Alaska⁴ and between Ontario and Minnesota.⁵

Consequently, we urge the Forest Service and BLM to:

- 1) Take immediate measures to reassess the safety, construction and design of existing and proposed tailings dams on public lands in the U.S., and to create an independent panel to participate in that review.
- 2) Review the recommendations from the Mount Polley tailings dam review panel, and incorporate their recommendations into the agency's review of existing and proposed mines.
- 3) Support an International Joint Commission review of the transboundary mines, particularly those on the Canada and U.S. border that present a risk to public lands, U.S. waters and fisheries.
- 4) Recognize that there are certain places where the downstream values are too great to expose to the risks associated with the placement of a tailings dam that must be maintained in perpetuity.

Given that tailings dams must store mine waste in perpetuity, these facilities warrant the most rigorous review and the stringent standards. The clean up of modern hardrock mines – without dam failures – can cost hundreds of millions of dollars per mine. With failures,

⁴ Canadian Press, "Alaska Tribal Groups Urge International Commission to Study BC Mine Safety," VanCouver Sun, Feb. 9, 2015.

<http://www.vancouversun.com/business/Alaska+tribal+groups+urge+international+commission+study+mine/10800445/story.html>

⁵ International Joint Commission, letter to U.S. Department of State and Foreign Affairs and International Trade Canada, re: transboundary mine issues affecting the International Rainy-Lake of the Woods Watershed, January 22, 2015.

reclamation could exceed one billion dollars. These facilities warrant the most rigorous review and the most stringent standards.

We look forward to a response and welcome the opportunity for a more detailed discussion on these matters.

Sincerely,

Jennifer Krill
Executive Director
EARTHWORKS
1612 K ST. NW #808
Washington DC 20006

Athan Manuel
Public Lands Director
Sierra Club
50 F Street, NW 8th Floor
Washington DC 20001

John Robison
Public Lands Director
Idaho Conservation League
PO Box 844, Boise ID 83701

Lilias Jarding
Clean Water Alliance
Rapid City, SD 57709
www.bhcleanwateralliance.org

Mary Costello
Executive Director
Rock Creek Alliance
P.O. Box 2636
Sandpoint, Idaho 83864

David Kliegman
Executive Director
Okanagan Highlands Alliance
P.O. Box 163
Tonasket, WA 98855

Betsy Daub
Policy Director
Friends of the Boundary Waters
Wilderness
401 North 3rd St.
Minneapolis, MN 55401

Barbara Ullian
Coordinator
Friends of the Kalmiopsis
Grants Pass, Oregon 97526

Wendy Russell
Coordinator
Patagonia Area Resource Alliance
P.O. Box 1044
Patagonia, AZ 85624

Kristen Larsen
Executive Director
Friends of the Cloquet Valley State Forest
49 East Palkie Road,
Esko, MN 55733

Mark Fink
Senior Attorney
Center for Biological Diversity
209 East 7th St.
Duluth, MN 55805

Mike Peterson
Executive Director
The Lands Council
25 W. Main, Suite 222
Spokane, WA 99201

Will Patric
Executive Director
Rivers Without Borders
P.O. Box 1968,
Port Townsend, WA 98368

Jennifer Thurston
Director
Information Network for
Responsible Mining
P.O. Box 27
Norwood, CO 81423

Christina Miller
Executive Director
Ethical Metalsmiths
P.O. Box 156
College Corner, OH 45003

Michael Saftler
President
Advocacy Coalition of Telluride
Telluride, Co. 81435

Roberta Frampton Benefiel
Grand Riverkeeper Labrador, Inc.
Happy Valley-Goose Bay
Labrador NL A0P 1E0

Carl Wassillie
Yupiaq Biologist
Big Village Network
8101 Peck Ave #88
Anchorage, AK 99504

John Hadder
Executive Director
Great Basin Resource Watch
236 Keystone
Reno, NV 89503

LeRoger Lind
President
Save Lake Superior Association
P.O. Box 101
Two Harbors, MN 55616

Al Gedicks
Executive Secretary
Wisconsin Resources Protection Council
PO Box 263
Tomahawk, WI 54487

Jim Jensen
Executive Director
Montana Environmental Information Center
P.O. Box 1184
Helena, MT 59601

Elizabeth Dabney
Executive Director
Northern Alaska Environmental Center
830 College Road
Fairbanks, AK 99701

Bobby Andrew
Alaska Native Elder
P.O. Box 735
Dillingham, AK 99576

Ivan Weber
953 1st. Ave
Salt Lake City, UT 84103

Nancy Hilding
President
Prairie Hills Audubon Society
P.O. Box 788
Black Hawk, SD 57718

Lori Anderson
Board President
Save Our Sky Blue Waters
P.O. Box 3661
Duluth MN 55803

Bob Fulkerson
Executive Director
Progressive Leadership Alliance Network
821 Riverside Drive
Reno, NV 89503

Jennifer Thurston
Information Network for
Responsible Mining
P.O. Box 27
Norwood, CO 81423

Ugo Lapointe
Mining Watch Canada
508-250 City Centre Ave.
Ottawa, ON K1R 6K7
Canada

Kimberly Baker
Executive Director
Klamath Forest Alliance
P.O.. Box 21
Orleans, CA 95556

Natalynne DeLapp
Executive Director
Environmental Protection Information
Center (EPIC)
145 G. St., Suite A
Arcata, CA 95521

Rich Eichstadt
Attorney
Spokane Riverkeeper
35 West Main, Suite 30
Spokane, WA 99201

Rachel Garwin
Policy Director
Northeastern Minnesotans for Wilderness
PO Box 625
Ely, Minnesota 55731

Cc: REGIONAL FOREST SERVICE OFFICES
STATE BLM OFFICES